

How Qualitative Researchers Discuss Quality Research

Judith Preissle, Melissa Freeman, Kathleen deMarrais, Kathryn Roulston, and Elizabeth St. Pierre

To warrant our claim that that the terms warrant, claim, evidence, and standards are used rarely in the qualitative research literature and that discussions on quality in qualitative research focus more generally on validity, we provide a systematic examination of the literature. We began with Judith Preissle's Endnote library of over 900 books on or related to qualitative research methods and design. She first selected all the general books on qualitative research methods and design in the variety of disciplinary areas (social science, education, social work, sociology, and such) rather than texts in specialized methods like focus groups or narrative analysis. If more than one edition was available, she selected across editions. She added books on qualitative analysis because these books might be most likely to discuss how researchers support what they believe they have found. Books with no indices were excluded.

She first searched for these terms in the index of each book: **warrant, claim, evidence, standards (for research), validity**; she also looked at chapter titles for clues; if she did not find even the term validity in the index, she browsed the index for any related term. If she saw related terms in her search of the indices and chapter titles, she included them, but she did not read through the entire index of each book for all relevant terms. Below are the books searched and the terms that appeared in the indices or chapter titles.

When she finished working with her own Endnote library, she invited the remaining members of the team to add titles she had missed from their own data bases, and these are included here. A major limitation, of course, is that the search includes only those journal articles reprinted in anthologies on the list (e.g., Huberman and Miles, 2002).

Agar, M. H. (1980). *The Professional Stranger: An Informal Introduction to Ethnography*. New York, Academic Press. **Verification under interviews; validation under observation; ch. section called "Reasons for Worrying about Methods" indirectly addresses evaluating studies**

Agar, M. H. (1996). *The Professional Stranger: An Informal Introduction to Ethnography*. 2nd ed. New York, Academic Press. **Ch. section called "Reasons for Worrying about Methods" indirectly addresses evaluating studies; verification and validation have disappeared from index**

Alford, R. R. (1998). *The Craft of Inquiry: Theories, Methods, Evidence*. New York, Oxford University Press. **Warranting community, evidence, truth, arguments**

Atkinson, P., A. Coffey, et al. (2003). *Key Themes in Qualitative Research: Continuities and Changes*. Walnut Creek, CA, Altamira Press. **Evidentiality (belief of speaker in what is said), credibility, plausibility, veracity, triangulation, truth**

Atkinson, P., A. Coffey, et al., Eds. (2001). *Handbook of Ethnography*. Thousand Oaks, CA, Sage. **Triangulation; no chs. on evaluating qual**

Auerbach, C. F. and L. B. Silverstein (2003). *Qualitative Data: An Introduction to Coding and Analysis*. New York, New York University Press. **Validity, justifiability, transparency, communicability, coherence, transferability**

Bailey, C. A. (1996). *A Guide to Field Research*. Thousand Oaks, CA, Pine Forge Press. **Validity, triangulation, supporting documentation**

Berg, B. L. (2007). *Qualitative Research Methods for the Social Sciences*. Boston, Pearson Allen & Bacon. **Validation, verification, triangulation**

Bernard, H. R. (1994). *Research Methods in Anthropology: Qualitative and Quantitative Approaches*. Walnut Creek, CA, Altamira. **Validity**

Bogdan, R. C. and S. K. Biklen (1982). *Qualitative Research for Education: An Introduction to Theory and Methods*. Boston, Allyn & Bacon. **Some issues addressed in ch. heading “Eight Common Questions about Qualitative Research” (i.e., is it scientific, generalizable, and other such issues of limitations)**

Bogdan, R. C. and S. K. Biklen (2007). *Qualitative Research for Education: An Introduction to Theory and Methods*. 5th ed. Boston, Pearson. **Convincing, contribution, triangulation in section on writing qual**

Bogdan, R. C. and S. J. Taylor (1975). *Introduction to Qualitative Research Methods: A Phenomenological Approach to the Social Sciences*. Boston, Allyn & Bacon. **Truth**

Boyatzis, R. E. (1998). *Transforming Qualitative Information: Thematic Analysis and Code Development*. Thousand Oaks, CA, Sage. **Validation, reliability**

Brinberg, D. and J. E. McGrath (1985). *Validity and the Research Process*. Newbury Park, CA, Sage. **Validity (philosophical and technical)**

Bruyn, S. T. (1966). *The Human Perspective in Sociology: The Method of Participant Observation*. Englewood Cliffs, NJ, Prentice-Hall. **Validity**

Bryman, A. (1988). *Quantity and quality in social research*. London, Routledge. **Validity**

Bryman, A., and Robert G. Burgess, Ed. (1994). *Analyzing Qualitative Data*. London, Routledge. **Validity, triangulation**

Burgess, R. G. (1984). *In the Field: An Introduction to Field Research*. London, Allen & Unwin. **Validity, triangulation, evaluating field studies**

Burgess, R. G., Ed. (1994). *Issues in Qualitative Research*. Studies in Qualitative Methodology. Greenwich, CT, JAI Press. **Nothing on evaluation qual**

Cicourel, A. (1964). *Method and Measurement in Sociology*. New York, Free Press. **Truth**

Coffey, A. and P. Atkinson (1996). *Making Sense of Qualitative Data: Complementary Research Strategies*. Thousand Oaks, CA, Sage. **In text they use other language for warranted claims**

Crabtree, B. F. and W. L. Miller, Eds. (1992). *Doing Qualitative Research. Research Methods for Primary Care*. Newbury Park, CA, Sage. **Validity, triangulation, verification**

Creswell, J. W. (1997). *Qualitative Inquiry and Research Design: Choosing Among Five Traditions*. Thousand Oaks, CA, Sage. **Verification (lots of entries); triangulation**

Creswell, J. W. (2003). *Research Design: Qualitative, Quantitative, and Mixed Methods Approaches*. Thousand Oaks, CA, Sage. **Validity**

Delamont, S. (1992). *Fieldwork in Educational Settings: Methods, Pitfalls and Perspectives*. London, Falmer Press. **Validity, reliability, triangulation**

Delamont, S. (2002). *Fieldwork in Educational Settings: Methods, Pitfalls and Perspectives*. London, Routledge Falmer. **Triangulation but no validity though used in the text**

deMarrais, K. and S. D. Lapan, Eds. (2004). *Foundations for Research: Methods of Inquiry in Education and the Social Sciences. Inquiry and Pedagogy across Diverse Contexts*. Mahwah, NJ, Lawrence Erlbaum. **Validity (lots of entries)**

Denzin, N. K. (1970). *The Research Act: A Theoretical Introduction to Sociological Methods*. Chicago, Aldine. **Validity, verification, triangulation**

Denzin, N. K. (1978). *The Research Act: A Theoretical Introduction to Sociological Methods*. New York, McGraw-Hill. **Same entries as 1970 (I don't have the 1988 edition)**

Denzin, N. K. and Y. S. Lincoln, Eds. (1994). *Handbook of Qualitative Research*. Thousand Oaks, CA, Sage. **Evidence, epistemological claims (in the Schwandt ch.); truth, verification, validity (big entry); triangulation; Altheide & Johnson's ch. "Criteria for Assessing Interpretive Validity in Qualitative Research"**

Denzin, N. K. and Y. S. Lincoln, Eds. (2000). *Handbook of Qualitative Research*. Thousand Oaks, CA, Sage. **Claims, evidence-based medicine, validity (huge entry), truth, triangulation (verification disappears); ch from Smith and Deemers "The Problem of Criteria in the Age of Relativism"; Ch. from Gergen and Gergen**

Denzin, N. K. and Y. S. Lincoln, Eds. (2005). *The Sage Handbook of Qualitative Research*. Thousand Oaks, CA, Sage. **Validity, truth, triangulation (not so big as previous editions); Warranted assertion (Smith & Hodkinson in "Relativism, Criteria, and Politics" ch.; evidence-based epistemology, research, medicine (clinical)—criticized in material by Denzin, Lincoln, Ladson-Billings and Donnor; research standards in Lincoln's ch. on IRB's where she also discusses the NRC report**

Dey, I. (1993). *Qualitative Data Analysis: A User-Friendly Guide for Social Scientists*. London, Routledge. **Validity, evidence (lots of entries), corroborating evidence**

Diesing, P. (1991). *How Does Social Science Work? Reflections on Practice*. Pittsburgh, University of Pittsburgh. **Producing knowledge**

Dobbert, M. L. (1982). *Ethnographic Research: Theory and Application for Modern Schools and Societies*. New York, Praeger. **Validity, verification; chs.: Recording and Assuring Quality Data” and “Achieving Reliability and Validity in Fieldbased Data”**

Eisner, E. W. (1991). *The Enlightened Eye: Qualitative Inquiry and the Enhancement of Educational Practice*. New York, Macmillan. **Evidence and structured corroboration, validity, triangulation**

Eisner, E. W. and A. Peshkin, Eds. (1990). *Qualitative Inquiry in Education: The Continuing Debate*. New York, Teachers College Press. **Validity (lots of entries); whole book is about how good qualitative research is**

Ely, M., M. with Anzul, et al. (1991). *Doing Qualitative Research: Circles within Circles*. London, Falmer Press. **Validity, triangulation, trustworthiness**

Emerson, R. M., Ed. (1983). *Contemporary Field Research*. Boston, Little, Brown. **Reliability, evidence shows up in chapter section head**

Erlandson, D. A., E. L. Harris, et al. (1993). *Doing Naturalistic Inquiry: A Guide to Methods*. Newbury Park, CA, Sage. **Validity, triangulation, trustworthiness, truth, credibility, transferability, dependability, confirmability; 2 chapters on these**

Esterberg, K. G. (2002). *Qualitative Methods in Social Research*. Boston, McGraw-Hill. **Tiangulation, small section in one chapter on “grounding the analysis”**

Ezzy, D. (2002). *Qualitative Analysis: Practice and Innovation*. London, Routledge. **Truth, rigour**

Fetterman, D. M. (1998). *Ethnography: Step by Step*. Thousand Oaks, CA, Sage. **Validity, triangulation**

Flick, U. (1998). *An Introduction to Qualitative Research*. Thousand Oaks, CA, Sage. **Validity, reliability, validation, triangulation, trustworthiness, transferability**

Gilbert, N., Ed. (1993). *Researching Social Life*. London, Sage. **Validity, truth, triangulation**

Gilgun, J. F., Kerry Daly, and Gerald Handel, Ed. (1992). *Qualitative Methods in Family Research*. Newbury Park, CA, Sage. **Validity, triangulation**

- Glaser, B. G. and A. L. Strauss (1967). *The Discovery of Grounded Theory: Strategies for Qualitative Research*. Chicago, Aldine. **Credibility, trust, verification**
- Glazier, J. D. and R. Powell, Eds. (1992). *Qualitative Research in Information Management*. Englewood, CO, Libraries Unlimited. **Validity, triangulation**
- Glesne, C. (2006). *Becoming Qualitative Researchers: An Introduction*. 3rd ed. Boston, Pearson. **Validity, triangulation, trustworthiness**
- Glesne, C. and A. Peshkin (1992). *Becoming Qualitative Researchers: An Introduction*. White Plains, NY, Longman. **Trustworthiness, triangulation**
- Goetz, J. P. and M. D. LeCompte (1984). *Ethnography and Qualitative Design in Educational Research*. New York, Academic Press. **Validity, reliability, credibility**
- Goode, W.J. and P.K. Hatt (1952). *Methods in social research*. New York: McGraw-Hill. **Validity**
- Goodwin, W.L. and L.D. Goodwin (1996). *Understanding quantitative and qualitative research in early childhood education*. New York: Teachers College Press. **Reliability, validity, triangulation**
- Green, J. L., G. Camilli, et al., Eds. (2006). *Handbook of complementary methods in education research*. Washington, DC, American Educational Research Association. **Evidence-based practice, validity, triangulation**
- Guba, E. G., Ed. (1990). *The Paradigm Dialog*. Newbury Park, CA, Sage. **Warranted assertions (in articles by Phillips, Greene, Lather, and Smith), validity, goodness criteria, truth**
- Gubrium, J. F. and J. A. Holstein (1996). *The New Language of Qualitative Method*. New York, Oxford University Press. **Authority, richness**
- Gubrium, J. F. and J. A. Holstein (2002). *Handbook of Interview Research: Context and Method*. Thousand Oaks, CA, Sage. **Validity, triangulation, truth, transcription quality**
- Gummesson, E. (1991). *Qualitative Methods in Management Research*. Newbury Park, CA, Sage. **Validity, triangulation**
- Hakim, C. (1987). *Research Design: Strategies and Choices in the Design of Social Research*. London, Allen & Unwin. **Triangulation**
- Hammersley, M. (1990). *Classroom Ethnography: Empirical and Methodological Essays*. Philadelphia, Open University Press. **Validity, triangulation**
- Hammersley, M., Ed. (1993). *Social Research: Philosophy, Politics and Practice*. London, Sage. **Validity, transferability, translatability**

Hammersley, M. and P. Atkinson (1983). *Ethnography: Principles in Practice*. London, Tavistock. **Validity, validation, triangulation**

Hammersley, M. and P. Atkinson (1995). *Ethnography: Principles in Practice*. 2nd ed. London, Tavistock. **Validation, triangulation**

Hardy, M. and A. Bryman, Eds. (2004). *Handbook of Data Analysis*. Thousand Oaks, CA, Sage. **Validity, triangulation**

Hatch, J. A., Ed. (1995). *Qualitative Research in Early Childhood Settings*. Westport, CT, Praeger.

Heaton, J. (2004). *Reworking Qualitative Data*. London, Sage. **Validation, verification, veracity claims, criteria for evaluating qualitative research papers**

Hesse-Biber, S. N. and P. Leavy (2006). *The practice of qualitative research*. Thousand Oaks, CA, Sage. **Validity, triangulation**

Holliday, A. (2002). *Doing and writing qualitative research*. London, Sage. **Validity, verisimilitude, triangulation**

Huberman, A. M. and M. B. Miles, Eds. (2002). *The qualitative researcher's companion*. Thousand Oaks, CA, Sage. **Validity, judging quality**

Jackson, B. (1987). *Fieldwork*. Urbana, IL, University of Illinois Press. **Truth**

Johnson, B. and L. Christensen (2000). *Educational Research: Quantitative and Qualitative Approaches*. Boston, Allyn & Bacon. **Validity**

Johnson, J. M. (1975). *Doing Field Research*. New York, Free Press. **Validity**

Jones, S. R., V. Torres, et al. (2006). *Negotiating the complexities of qualitative research in higher education: Fundamental elements and issues*. New York, Routledge. **Validity, triangulation, goodness of qualitative research**

Jorgensen, D. L. (1989). *Participant Observation: A Methodology for Human Studies*. Newbury Park, CA, Sage. **Valid, validity, truth**